Title stata.com

**eoprobit** — Extended ordered probit regression

Description Quick start Menu Syntax

Options Remarks and examples Stored results Methods and formulas

References Also see

# **Description**

eoprobit fits an ordered probit regression model that accommodates any combination of endogenous covariates, nonrandom treatment assignment, and endogenous sample selection. Continuous, binary, and ordinal endogenous covariates are allowed. Treatment assignment may be endogenous or exogenous. A probit or tobit model may be used to account for endogenous sample selection.

xteoprobit fits a random-effects ordered probit regression model that accommodates endogenous covariates, treatment, and sample selection in the same way as eoprobit and also accounts for correlation of observations within panels or within groups.

## **Quick start**

Ordered probit regression of y on x with continuous endogenous covariate y2 modeled by x and z eoprobit y x, endogenous (y2 = x z)

Same as above, but adding continuous endogenous covariate y3 modeled by x and z2 eoprobit y x, endogenous(y2 = x z) endogenous(y3 = x z2)

Ordered probit regression of y on x with binary endogenous covariate d modeled by x and z eoprobit y x, endogenous(d = x z, probit)

Ordered probit regression of y on x with endogenous treatment recorded in trtvar and modeled by x and z

```
eoprobit y x, entreat(trtvar = x z)
```

Ordered probit regression of y on x with exogenous treatment recorded in trtvar eoprobit y x, extreat(trtvar)

Random-effects ordered probit regression of y on x using xtset data xteoprobit y x

Ordered probit regression of y on x with endogenous sample-selection indicator selvar modeled by x and z

```
eoprobit y x, select(selvar = x z)
```

Same as above, but adding endogenous covariate y2 modeled by x and z2 eoprobit y x, select(selvar = x z) endogenous(y2 = x z2)

Same as above, but adding endogenous treatment recorded in trtvar and modeled by x and z3 eoprobit y x, select(selvar = x z) endogenous(y2 = x z2) /// entreat(trtvar = x z3)

Same as above, but with random effects and without endogenous treatment xteoprobit y x, select(selvar = x z) endogenous(y2 = x z2)

### Menu

#### eoprobit

Statistics > Endogenous covariates > Models adding selection and treatment > Ordered probit regression

### xteoprobit

 ${\it Statistics} > {\it Longitudinal/panel data} > {\it Endogenous covariates} > {\it Models adding selection and treatment} > {\it Ordered probit regression (RE)}$ 

# Syntax 5 4 1

Basic ordered probit regression with endogenous covariates

```
eoprobit depvar \ [indepvars], \underline{endog}enous(depvars_{en} = varlist_{en}) [options]
```

Basic ordered probit regression with endogenous treatment assignment

```
eoprobit depvar [indepvars], entreat(depvar_{tr} [= varlist_{tr}]) [options]
```

Basic ordered probit regression with exogenous treatment assignment

```
eoprobit depvar [indepvars], extreat(tvar) [options]
```

Basic ordered probit regression with sample selection

```
eoprobit depvar [indepvars], \underline{sel}ect(depvar_s = varlist_s) [options]
```

Basic ordered probit regression with tobit sample selection

```
eoprobit depvar [indepvars], \underline{tobitsel}ect(depvar_s = varlist_s) [options]
```

Basic ordered probit regression with random effects

```
xteoprobit depvar [indepvars] [, options]
```

Ordered probit regression combining endogenous covariates, treatment, and selection

```
eoprobit depvar [indepvars][if][in][weight][, extensions options]
```

Ordered probit regression combining random effects, endogenous covariates, treatment, and selection

```
xteoprobit depvar [indepvars] [if] [in] [, extensions options]
```

extensions	Description
Model	
endogenous(enspec)	model for endogenous covariates; may be repeated
entreat(entrspec)	model for endogenous treatment assignment
<pre>extreat(extrspec)</pre>	exogenous treatment
<pre>select(selspec)</pre>	probit model for selection
<pre>tobitselect(tselspec)</pre>	tobit model for selection
options	Description
Model	
$\underline{\text{off}}$ set( $varname_o$ )	include varnameo in model with coefficient constrained to 1
<pre>constraints(numlist)</pre>	apply specified linear constraints
SE/Robust	
vce(vcetype)	$vcetype$ may be oim, $\underline{r}$ obust, $\underline{cl}$ uster $clustvar$ , opg, $\underline{boot}$ strap, or $\underline{jack}$ knife
Reporting	
<u>l</u> evel(#)	set confidence level; default is level(95)
<u>nocnsr</u> eport	do not display constraints
display_options	control columns and column formats, row spacing, line width, display of omitted variables and base and empty cells, and factor-variable labeling
Integration	
<pre>intpoints(#)</pre>	set the number of integration (quadrature) points for integration over four or more dimensions; default is intpoints (128)
<pre>triintpoints(#)</pre>	set the number of integration (quadrature) points for integration over three dimensions; default is triintpoints(10)
reintpoints(#)	set the number of integration (quadrature) points for random-effects integration; default is reintpoints(7)
<u>reintmethod</u> (intmethod)	integration method for random effects; <i>intmethod</i> may be <a href="mvaghermite"><u>mvaghermite</u></a> (the default) or <a href="mailto:ghermite">ghermite</a>
Maximization	
maximize_options	control the maximization process; seldom used
<u>col</u> linear	keep collinear variables
<u>coefl</u> egend	display legend instead of statistics

```
enspec is depvars<sub>en</sub> = varlist_{en} [, enopts]
```

where depvarsen is a list of endogenous covariates. Each variable in depvarsen specifies an endogenous covariate model using the common varlisten and options.

```
entrspec is depvar_{tr}[=varlist_{tr}][, entropts]
```

where  $depvar_{tr}$  is a variable indicating treatment assignment.  $varlist_{tr}$  is a list of covariates predicting treatment assignment.

```
extrspec is tvar [, extropts]
```

where tvar is a variable indicating treatment assignment.

```
selspec is depvar_s = varlist_s [, selopts]
```

where  $depvar_s$  is a variable indicating selection status.  $depvar_s$  must be coded as 0, indicating that the observation was not selected, or 1, indicating that the observation was selected.  $varlist_s$  is a list of covariates predicting selection.

```
tselspec is depvar_s = varlist_s [, tselopts]
```

where  $depvar_s$  is a continuous variable.  $varlist_s$  is a list of covariates predicting  $depvar_s$ . The censoring status of  $depvar_s$  indicates selection, where a censored  $depvar_s$  indicates that the observation was not selected and a noncensored  $depvar_s$  indicates that the observation was selected.

enopts	Description
Model	
probit	treat endogenous covariate as binary
oprobit	treat endogenous covariate as ordinal
pocorrelation	estimate different correlations for each level of a binary or an ordinal endogenous covariate
<u>nom</u> ain	do not add endogenous covariate to main equation
nore	do not include random effects in model for endogenous covariate
$\underline{\mathtt{nocons}}\mathtt{tant}$	suppress constant term

nore is available only with xteoprobit.

entropts	Description
Model	
pocorrelation	estimate different correlations for each potential outcome
<u>nom</u> ain	do not add treatment indicator to main equation
<u>nocutsint</u> eract	do not interact treatment with cutpoints
<u>noint</u> eract	do not interact treatment with covariates in main equation
nore	do not include random effects in model for endogenous treatment
<u>nocons</u> tant	suppress constant term
$\underline{\text{off}}$ set( $varname_o$ )	include $varname_o$ in model with coefficient constrained to 1

nore is available only with xteoprobit.

extropts	Description
Model	
pocorrelation	estimate different correlations for each potential outcome
<u>nom</u> ain	do not add treatment indicator to main equation
$\underline{\mathtt{nocutsint}}\mathtt{eract}$	do not interact treatment with cutpoints
<u>noint</u> eract	do not interact treatment with covariates in main equation

selopts	Description
Model	
nore	do not include random effects in selection model
<u>nocons</u> tant	suppress constant term
$ \underline{\text{off}}_{\text{set}}(varname_o) $	include varname <sub>o</sub> in model with coefficient constrained to 1

nore is available only with xteoprobit.

tselopts	Description
Model	
* 11 ( <i>varname</i>   #)	left-censoring variable or limit
*ul(varname   #)	right-censoring variable or limit
main	add censored selection variable to main equation
nore	do not include random effects in tobit selection model
<u>nocons</u> tant	suppress constant term
$\underline{\texttt{off}} \mathtt{set}(varname_o)$	include varnameo in model with coefficient constrained to 1

<sup>\*</sup> You must specify either 11() or ul(). nore is available only with xteoprobit.

indepvars, varlisten, varlisten, and varlists may contain factor variables; see [U] 11.4.3 Factor variables.

depvar, indepvars, depvarsen, varlisten, depvartr, varlister, tvar, depvars, and varlists may contain time-series operators; see [U] 11.4.4 Time-series varlists.

bootstrap, by, collect, jackknife, and statsby are allowed with eoprobit and xteoprobit. rolling and svy are allowed with eoprobit. See [U] 11.1.10 Prefix commands.

Weights are not allowed with the bootstrap prefix; see [R] bootstrap.

vce() and weights are not allowed with the svy prefix; see [SVY] svy.

fweights, iweights, and pweights are allowed with eoprobit; see [U] 11.1.6 weight.

reintpoints() and reintmethod() are available only with xteoprobit.

sformat(\( \fint \), and nolstretch; see [R] Estimation options.

collinear and coeflegend do not appear in the dialog box.

See [U] 20 Estimation and postestimation commands for more capabilities of estimation commands.

# **Options**

```
endogenous(enspec), entreat(entrspec), extreat(extrspec), select(selspec), tobitselect(tselspec), re; see [ERM] ERM options.

offset(varnameo), constraints(numlist); see [R] Estimation options.

SE/Robust
vce(vcetype); see [ERM] ERM options.

Reporting
level(#), nocnsreport; see [R] Estimation options.

display_options: noci, nopvalues, noomitted, vsquish, noemptycells, baselevels,
```

allbaselevels, nofvlabel, fvwrap(#), fvwrapon(style), cformat(% fmt), pformat(% fmt),

Integration

intpoints(#), triintpoints(#), reintpoints(#), reintmethod(intmethod); see [ERM] ERM
 options.

Maximization

maximize\_options: difficult, technique(algorithm\_spec), iterate(#), [no]log, trace,
 gradient, showstep, hessian, showtolerance, tolerance(#), ltolerance(#),
 nrtolerance(#), nonrtolerance, and from(init\_specs); see [R] Maximize.

The default technique for eoprobit is technique(nr). The default technique for xteoprobit is technique(bhhh 10 nr 2).

Setting the optimization type to technique(bhhh) resets the default vcetype to vce(opg).

The following options are available with eoprobit and xteoprobit but are not shown in the dialog box:

collinear, coeflegend; see [R] Estimation options.

# Remarks and examples

stata.com

eoprobit and xteoprobit fit models that we refer to as "extended ordered probit regression models", meaning that they accommodate endogenous covariates, nonrandom treatment assignment, endogenous sample selection, and panel data or other grouped data.

eoprobit fits models for cross-sectional data (one-level models). eoprobit can account for endogenous covariates, treatment, and sample selection, whether these complications arise individually or in combination.

xteoprobit fits random-effects models (two-level models) for panel data or grouped data. xteoprobit accounts for endogenous covariates, treatment, and sample selection in the same way as eoprobit and also accounts for within-panel or within-group correlation among observations.

In this entry, you will find information on the syntax for the eoprobit and xteoprobit commands. You can see *Methods and formulas* for a full description of the models that can be fit with eoprobit and xteoprobit and details about how those models are fit.

More information on extended ordered probit models is found in the separate introductions and example entries. We recommend reading those entries to learn how to use eoprobit and xteoprobit. Below, we provide a guide to help you locate the ones that will be helpful to you.

For an introduction to eoprobit and xteoprobit and the other extended regression commands for continuous, interval, and binary outcomes, see [ERM] Intro 1–[ERM] Intro 9.

[ERM] Intro 1 introduces the ERM commands, the problems they address, and their syntax.

[ERM] Intro 2 provides background on the four types of models—linear regression, interval regression, probit regression, and ordered probit regression—that can be fit using ERM commands.

[ERM] Intro 3 considers the problem of endogenous covariates and how to solve it using ERM commands.

[ERM] Intro 4 gives an overview of endogenous sample selection and using ERM commands to account for it when fitting a linear, interval, probit, or ordered probit model.

[ERM] Intro 5 covers nonrandom treatment assignment and how to account for it using eoprobit or any of the other ERM commands.

[ERM] Intro 6 covers random-effects models for panel data and other grouped data. It discusses xteoprobit and the other ERM commands for panel data.

[ERM] Intro 7 discusses interpretation of results. You can interpret coefficients from eoprobit and xteoprobit in the usual way, but this introduction goes beyond the interpretation of coefficients. We demonstrate how to find answers to interesting questions by using margins. If your model includes an endogenous covariate or an endogenous treatment, the use of margins differs from its use after other estimation commands, so we strongly recommend reading this intro if you are fitting these types of models.

[ERM] Intro 8 will be particularly helpful if you are familiar with heckoprobit or xtoprobit and other commands that address endogenous covariates, sample selection, nonrandom treatment assignment, or random effects. This introduction is a Rosetta stone that maps the syntax of those commands to the syntax of eoprobit and xteoprobit.

[ERM] Intro 9 walks you through an example that gives insight into the concepts of endogenous covariates, treatment assignment, and sample selection while fitting models with eregress that address these complications. Although the example uses eregress, the discussion applies equally to eoprobit. This intro also demonstrates how to interpret results by using margins and estat teffects.

Additional examples are presented in [ERM] Example 1a-[ERM] Example 9. For examples using eoprobit, see

```
[ERM] Example 6a
                      Ordered probit regression with endogenous treatment
                      Ordered probit regression with endogenous treatment
[ERM] Example 6b
                         and sample selection
```

For an example using xteoprobit, see

```
Ordered probit regression with endogenous treatment
[ERM] Example 9
                       and random effects
```

See Examples in [ERM] Intro for an overview of all the examples. All examples may be interesting because they handle complications in the same way.

eoprobit and xteoprobit fit many models discussed in the literature. For instance, eoprobit can be used to fit models like the ordered probit model with endogenous sample selection discussed in De Luca and Perotti (2011) and the ordered probit models with continuous or binary endogenous covariates discussed in Wooldridge (2010, sec. 16.3.3). Roodman (2011) investigated ordered probit models with endogenous covariates and endogenous sample selection and demonstrated how multiple observational data complications could be addressed with a triangular model structure. He and Tamás Bartus showed how random effects could be used in the triangular model structure in Bartus and Roodman (2014). Roodman's work has been used to model processes like the effect of living with a child on the happiness of the elderly (Chyi and Mao 2012) and the effect of parental migration on child education (Botezat and Pfeiffer 2014).

# Stored results

eoprobit stores the following in e():

```
Scalars
    e(N)
                              number of observations
    e(N_selected)
                              number of selected observations
    e(N_nonselected)
                              number of nonselected observations
    e(k)
                              number of parameters
    e(k_cat#)
                             number of categories for the #th depvar, ordinal
                              number of equations in e(b)
    e(k_eq)
```

```
e(k_eq_model)
                              number of equations in overall model test
    e(k_dv)
                              number of dependent variables
    e(k_aux)
                              number of auxiliary parameters
    e(df_m)
                              model degrees of freedom
    e(11)
                              log likelihood
    e(N_clust)
                             number of clusters
    e(chi2)
                             \chi^2
                             p-value for model test
    e(p)
    e(n_quad)
                             number of integration points for multivariate normal
    e(n_quad3)
                             number of integration points for trivariate normal
    e(rank)
                             rank of e(V)
    e(ic)
                             number of iterations
    e(rc)
                             return code
                              1 if converged, 0 otherwise
    e(converged)
Macros
    e(cmd)
                              eoprobit
    e(cmdline)
                             command as typed
                              names of dependent variables
    e(depvar)
    e(tsel_ll)
                              left-censoring limit for tobit selection
    e(tsel_ul)
                              right-censoring limit for tobit selection
    e(wtype)
                              weight type
                              weight expression
    e(wexp)
    e(title)
                             title in estimation output
                              name of cluster variable
    e(clustvar)
                             offset for the #th depvar, where # is determined by equation order in output
    e(offset#)
    e(chi2type)
                             Wald; type of model \chi^2 test
    e(vce)
                              vcetype specified in vce()
    e(vcetype)
                             title used to label Std. err.
    e(opt)
                              type of optimization
                             max or min; whether optimizer is to perform maximization or minimization
    e(which)
    e(ml_method)
                             type of ml method
                             name of likelihood-evaluator program
    e(user)
    e(technique)
                              maximization technique
    e(properties)
                             b V
    e(estat_cmd)
                              program used to implement estat
    e(predict)
                             program used to implement predict
    e(marginsok)
                              predictions allowed by margins
                              predictions disallowed by margins
    e(marginsnotok)
                              default predict() specification for margins
    e(marginsdefault)
    e(asbalanced)
                              factor variables fvset as asbalanced
    e(asobserved)
                              factor variables fyset as asobserved
Matrices
                              coefficient vector
    e(h)
    e(cat#)
                             categories for the #th depvar, ordinal
    e(Cns)
                             constraints matrix
                             iteration log (up to 20 iterations)
    e(ilog)
    e(gradient)
                              gradient vector
    e(V)
                              variance-covariance matrix of the estimators
    e(V_modelbased)
                              model-based variance
Functions
    e(sample)
                             marks estimation sample
```

In addition to the above, the following is stored in r():

```
Matrices
```

```
r(table) matrix containing the coefficients with their standard errors, test statistics, p-values, and confidence intervals
```

Note that results stored in r() are updated when the command is replayed and will be replaced when any r-class command is run after the estimation command.

#### xteoprobit stores the following in e():

```
Scalars
    e(N)
                              number of observations
    e(N_g)
                              number of groups
                              number of selected observations
    e(N_selected)
                              number of nonselected observations
    e(N_nonselected)
                              number of parameters
    e(k)
                              number of categories for the #th depvar, ordinal
    e(k_cat#)
    e(k_eq)
                              number of equations in e(b)
    e(k_eq_model)
                              number of equations in overall model test
    e(k_dv)
                              number of dependent variables
    e(k_aux)
                              number of auxiliary parameters
    e(df_m)
                              model degrees of freedom
    e(11)
                              log likelihood
                              number of clusters
    e(N_clust)
                              \chi^2
    e(chi2)
                              p-value for model test
    e(p)
    e(n_quad)
                              number of integration points for multivariate normal
    e(n_quad3)
                              number of integration points for trivariate normal
    e(n_requad)
                              number of integration points for random effects
    e(g_min)
                              smallest group size
    e(g_avg)
                              average group size
                              largest group size
    e(g_max)
    e(rank)
                              rank of e(V)
    e(ic)
                              number of iterations
    e(rc)
                              return code
    e(converged)
                              1 if converged, 0 otherwise
Macros
    e(cmd)
                              xteoprobit
    e(cmdline)
                              command as typed
                              names of dependent variables
    e(depvar)
    e(tsel_ll)
                              left-censoring limit for tobit selection
    e(tsel_ul)
                              right-censoring limit for tobit selection
                              variable denoting groups
    e(ivar)
    e(title)
                              title in estimation output
    e(clustvar)
                              name of cluster variable
                              offset for the #th depvar, where # is determined by equation order in output
    e(offset#)
    e(chi2type)
                              Wald; type of model \chi^2 test
    e(vce)
                              vcetype specified in vce()
    e(vcetype)
                              title used to label Std. err.
    e(reintmethod)
                              integration method for random effects
                              type of optimization
    e(opt)
    e(which)
                              max or min; whether optimizer is to perform maximization or minimization
                              type of ml method
    e(ml_method)
                              name of likelihood-evaluator program
    e(user)
                              maximization technique
    e(technique)
    e(properties)
    e(estat_cmd)
                              program used to implement estat
                              program used to implement predict
    e(predict)
    e(marginsok)
                              predictions allowed by margins
    e(marginsnotok)
                              predictions disallowed by margins
    e(marginsdefault)
                              default predict() specification for margins
    e(asbalanced)
                              factor variables fyset as asbalanced
    e(asobserved)
                              factor variables fyset as asobserved
Matrices
    e(b)
                              coefficient vector
    e(cat#)
                              categories for the #th depvar, ordinal
    e(Cns)
                              constraints matrix
    e(ilog)
                              iteration log (up to 20 iterations)
    e(gradient)
                              gradient vector
```

e(V) variance-covariance matrix of the estimators

e(V\_modelbased) model-based variance

Functions

e(sample) marks estimation sample

In addition to the above, the following is stored in r():

Matrices

r(table) matrix containing the coefficients with their standard errors, test statistics, p-values,

and confidence intervals

Note that results stored in r() are updated when the command is replayed and will be replaced when any r-class command is run after the estimation command.

### Methods and formulas

The methods and formulas presented here are for the ordered probit model. The estimators implemented in eoprobit and xteoprobit are maximum likelihood estimators covered by the results in chapter 13 of Wooldridge (2010) and White (1996).

The log-likelihood functions maximized by eoprobit and xteoprobit are implied by the triangular structure of the model. Specifically, the joint distribution of the endogenous variables is a product of conditional and marginal distributions because the model is triangular. For a few of the many relevant applications of this result in literature, see chapter 10 of Amemiya (1985); Heckman (1976, 1979); chapter 5 of Maddala (1983); Maddala and Lee (1976); sections 15.7.2, 15.7.3, 16.3.3, 17.5.2, and 19.7.1 in Wooldridge (2010); and Wooldridge (2014). Roodman (2011) and Bartus and Roodman (2014) used this result to derive the formulas discussed below.

Methods and formulas are presented under the following headings:

Introduction

Endogenous covariates

Continuous endogenous covariates

Binary and ordinal endogenous covariates

Treatment

Endogenous sample selection

Probit endogenous sample selection

Tobit endogenous sample selection

Random effects

Combinations of features

Confidence intervals

#### Introduction

An ordered probit regression of outcome  $y_i$  on covariates  $x_i$  may be written as

$$y_i = v_h$$
 iff  $\kappa_{h-1} < \mathbf{x}_i \boldsymbol{\beta} + \epsilon_i \le \kappa_h$ 

The values  $v_1, \ldots, v_H$  are real numbers such that  $v_h < v_m$  for h < m.  $\kappa_0$  is taken as  $-\infty$  and  $\kappa_H$  is taken as  $+\infty$ . The unobserved error  $\epsilon_i$  is standard normal.

The log likelihood for this model is

$$\ln\!L = \sum_{i=1}^{N} w_i \ln \begin{bmatrix} 1(y_i = v_1) \Phi\left(-\mathbf{x}_i \boldsymbol{\beta}\right) \\ + \sum_{h=2}^{H-1} 1(y_i = v_h) \left\{ \Phi\left(\kappa_h - \mathbf{x}_i \boldsymbol{\beta}\right) - \Phi\left(\kappa_{h-1} - \mathbf{x}_i \boldsymbol{\beta}\right) \right\} \\ + 1(y_i = v_H) \Phi\left(\mathbf{x}_i \boldsymbol{\beta}\right) \end{bmatrix}$$

where  $w_i$  are the weights.

For  $h = 0, \ldots, H$ , define

$$c_{ih} = \begin{cases} -\infty & h = 0 \\ \kappa_h - \mathbf{x}_i \boldsymbol{\beta} & h = 1, \dots, H - 1 \end{cases}$$

$$(1)$$

This leads to the limits

$$l_{1i} = c_{i(h-1)} \quad \text{if} \quad y_i = v_h \tag{2}$$

and

$$u_{1i} = c_{ih} \quad \text{if} \quad y_i = v_h \tag{3}$$

These are limits on the unobserved  $\epsilon_i$  based on the observed values of  $y_i$  and  $x_i$ . They let us rewrite the log likelihood concisely as

$$\ln L = \sum_{i=1}^{N} w_i \ln \Phi_1^*(l_{1i}, u_{1i}, 1)$$

The conditional probabilities of success can be written using similar notation. For h = 1, ..., H,

$$\Pr(y_i = v_h | \mathbf{x}_i) = \Phi_1^*(c_{i(h-1)}, c_{ih}, 1)$$
(4)

If you are willing to take our word for some derivations and notation, the following is complete. Longer explanations and derivations for some terms and functions are provided in *Methods and formulas* of [ERM] **eprobit**. For example, we need the two-sided probability function  $\Phi_d^*$  that is discussed in *Introduction* in [ERM] **eprobit**.

If you are interested in all the details, we suggest you read *Methods and formulas* of [ERM] **eprobit** in its entirety before reading this section. Here we mainly show how the complications that arise in ERMs are handled in an ordered probit framework.

# Endogenous covariates

#### Continuous endogenous covariates

An ordered probit regression of  $y_i$  on exogenous covariates  $\mathbf{x}_i$  and C continuous endogenous covariates  $\mathbf{w}_{ci}$  has the form

$$y_i = v_h$$
 iff  $\kappa_{h-1} < \mathbf{x}_i \boldsymbol{\beta} + \mathbf{w}_{ci} \boldsymbol{\beta}_c + \epsilon_i \le \kappa_h$   
$$\mathbf{w}_{ci} = \mathbf{z}_{ci} \mathbf{A}_c + \epsilon_{ci}$$

The values  $v_1, \ldots, v_H$  are real numbers such that  $v_h < v_m$  for h < m.  $\kappa_0$  is taken as  $-\infty$  and  $\kappa_H$  is taken as  $+\infty$ . The vector  $\mathbf{z}_{ci}$  contains variables from  $\mathbf{x}_i$  and other covariates that affect  $\mathbf{w}_{ci}$ . The unobserved errors  $\epsilon_i$  and  $\epsilon_{ci}$  are multivariate normal with mean 0 and covariance

$$\begin{bmatrix} 1 & \boldsymbol{\sigma}_{1c}' \\ \boldsymbol{\sigma}_{1c} & \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_c \end{bmatrix}$$

As in Continuous endogenous covariates in [ERM] eprobit, the likelihood can be written using the conditional density of  $\epsilon_i$  on  $\mathbf{w}_{ci}$ .

Now, for  $h = 0, \ldots, H$ , define

$$c_{ih} = \begin{cases} -\infty & h = 0 \\ \kappa_h - \mathbf{x}_i \boldsymbol{\beta} - \boldsymbol{\sigma}'_{1c} \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_c^{-1} \left( \mathbf{w}_{ci} - \mathbf{z}_{ci} \mathbf{A}_c \right)' & h = 1, \dots, H - 1 \\ \infty & h = H \end{cases}$$

These expressions used the conditional mean of  $\epsilon_i$ . The lower and upper limits for the  $y_i$  probability are

$$l_{1i} = c_{i(h-1)} \quad \text{if} \quad y_i = v_h$$

and

$$u_{1i} = c_{ih}$$
 if  $y_i = v_h$ 

Using these limits, the conditional variance, and the conditional density of  $\mathbf{w}_{ci}$ , we obtain the log likelihood

$$\ln L = \sum_{i=1}^{N} w_i \left\{ \ln \Phi_1^* \left( l_{1i}, u_{1i}, 1 - \boldsymbol{\sigma}'_{1c} \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_c^{-1} \boldsymbol{\sigma}_{1c} \right) + \ln \phi_C (\mathbf{w}_{ci} - \mathbf{z}_{ci} \mathbf{A}_c, \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_c) \right\}$$

The conditional probabilities of success can be written using similar notation. For  $h = 1, \ldots, H$ ,

$$\Pr(y_i = v_h | \mathbf{x}_i) = \Phi_1^*(c_{i(h-1)}, c_{ih}, 1 - \sigma_{1c}' \Sigma_c^{-1} \sigma_{1c})$$

#### Binary and ordinal endogenous covariates

Here we begin by formulating the ordered probit regression of  $y_i$  on exogenous covariates  $\mathbf{x}_i$  and B binary and ordinal endogenous covariates  $\mathbf{w}_{bi} = [w_{b1i}, \dots, w_{bBi}]$ . Indicator (dummy) variables for the levels of each binary and ordinal covariate are used in the model. You can also interact other covariates with the binary and ordinal endogenous covariates, as in treatment-effect models.

The binary and ordinal endogenous covariates  $\mathbf{w}_{bi}$  are formulated as in *Binary and ordinal endogenous covariates* in [ERM] **eprobit**.

The model for the outcome can be formulated with or without different correlation parameters for each level of  $\mathbf{w}_{bi}$ . Level-specific parameters are obtained by specifying pocorrelation in the endogenous() option.

If the correlation parameters are not level specific, we have

$$y_i = v_h$$
 iff  $\kappa_{h-1} < \mathbf{x}_i \boldsymbol{\beta} + \mathbf{wind}_{b1i} \boldsymbol{\beta}_{h1} + \cdots + \mathbf{wind}_{bBi} \boldsymbol{\beta}_{hB} + \epsilon_i \le \kappa_h$ 

where the values  $v_1, \ldots, v_H$  are real numbers such that  $v_h < v_m$  for h < m.  $\kappa_0$  is taken as  $-\infty$  and  $\kappa_H$  is taken as  $+\infty$ . The **wind**<sub>bji</sub> vectors are defined in *Binary and ordinal endogenous covariates* in [ERM] **eprobit**. The outcome error  $\epsilon_i$  and binary and ordinal endogenous errors  $\epsilon_{b1i}, \ldots, \epsilon_{bBi}$  are multivariate normal with mean 0 and covariance

$$oldsymbol{\Sigma} = egin{bmatrix} 1 & oldsymbol{
ho}'_{1b} \ oldsymbol{
ho}_{1b} & oldsymbol{\Sigma}_b \end{bmatrix}$$

From here, we discuss the model with ordinal endogenous covariates. The results for binary endogenous covariates are similar.

Now, for  $h = 0, \ldots, H$ , define

$$c_{ih} = \begin{cases} -\infty & h = 0 \\ \kappa_h - \mathbf{x}_i \boldsymbol{\beta} - \mathbf{wind}_{b1i} \boldsymbol{\beta}_{b1} - \dots - \mathbf{wind}_{bBi} \boldsymbol{\beta}_{bB} & h = 1, \dots, H - 1 \end{cases}$$

The lower and upper limits for the  $y_i$  probability are

$$l_{1i} = c_{i(h-1)} \quad \text{if} \quad y_i = v_h$$

and

$$u_{1i} = c_{ih}$$
 if  $y_i = v_h$ 

Let

$$\mathbf{l}_i = \begin{bmatrix} l_{1i} & l_{b1i} & \dots & l_{bBi} \end{bmatrix}$$
  
$$\mathbf{u}_i = \begin{bmatrix} u_{1i} & u_{b1i} & \dots & u_{bBi} \end{bmatrix}$$

where the  $l_{bji}$  and  $u_{bji}$  are the lower and upper limits for the binary and ordinal endogenous covariate probabilities. They are defined in *Binary and ordinal endogenous covariates* in [ERM] **eprobit**.

So the log likelihood for this model is

$$\mathrm{ln}L = \sum_{i=1}^{N} w_i \, \mathrm{ln} \Phi_{B+1}^*(\mathbf{l}_i, \mathbf{u}_i, \mathbf{\Sigma})$$

Now let

$$\mathbf{l}_{bi} = \begin{bmatrix} l_{b1i} & \dots & l_{bBi} \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\mathbf{u}_{bi} = \begin{bmatrix} u_{b1i} & \dots & u_{bBi} \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\mathbf{l}_{ih1} = \begin{bmatrix} c_{i(h-1)} & \mathbf{l}_{bi} \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\mathbf{u}_{ih1} = \begin{bmatrix} c_{ih} & \mathbf{u}_{bi} \end{bmatrix}$$

The conditional probabilities are

$$\Pr\left(y_i = v_h | \mathbf{x}_i, \mathbf{z}_{b1i}, \dots, \mathbf{z}_{bBi}, \mathbf{w}_{bi}\right) = \frac{\Phi_{B+1}^*(\mathbf{l}_{ih1}, \mathbf{u}_{ih1}, \boldsymbol{\Sigma})}{\Phi_B^*(\mathbf{l}_{bi}, \mathbf{u}_{bi}, \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_b)}$$

When the endogenous ordinal variables are different treatments, holding the correlation parameters constant over the treatment levels is a constrained form of the potential-outcome model. In an unconstrained potential-outcome model, the correlations between the outcome and the treatments—the endogenous ordinal regressors  $\mathbf{w}_{bi}$ —vary over the levels of each treatment.

In this unconstrained model, there is a different potential-outcome error for each level of each treatment. For example, when the endogenous treatment variable  $w_1$  has three levels (0, 1, and 2) and the endogenous treatment variable  $w_2$  has four levels (0, 1, 2, and 3), the unconstrained model has  $12 = 3 \times 4$  outcome errors. Because there is a different correlation between each potential outcome and each endogenous treatment, there are  $2 \times 12$  correlation parameters between the potential outcomes and the treatments in this example model.

We denote the number of different combinations of values for the endogenous treatments  $\mathbf{w}_{bi}$  by M, and we denote the vector of values in each combination by  $\mathbf{v}_j$   $(j \in \{1, 2, \dots, M\})$ . Letting  $k_{wp}$  be the number of levels of endogenous ordinal treatment variable  $p \in \{1, 2, \dots, B\}$  implies that  $M = k_{w1} \times k_{w2} \times \dots \times k_{wB}$ .

In this case, we have

$$y_i = \sum_{j=1}^{M} 1(\mathbf{w}_{bi} = \mathbf{v}_j) y_{ji}$$

where for  $j = 1, \ldots, M$ ,

$$y_{ji} = v_h$$
 iff  $\kappa_{h-1} < \mathbf{x}_i \boldsymbol{\beta} + \mathbf{wind}_{b1i} \boldsymbol{\beta}_{b1} + \dots + \mathbf{wind}_{bBi} \boldsymbol{\beta}_{bB} + \epsilon_{ji} \le \kappa_h$ 

The outcome errors  $\epsilon_{ji}$  and the endogenous errors  $\epsilon_{b1i},\ldots,\epsilon_{bBi}$  are multivariate normal with 0 mean and covariance

$$oldsymbol{\Sigma}_j = egin{bmatrix} 1 & oldsymbol{
ho}_{j1b}' \ oldsymbol{
ho}_{j1b} & oldsymbol{\Sigma}_b \end{bmatrix}$$

Now let

$$\Sigma_{i,b} = \sum_{j=1}^{M} 1(\mathbf{w}_{bi} = \mathbf{v}_j) \Sigma_j$$

Now the log likelihood for this model is

$$\mathrm{ln}L = \sum_{i=1}^N w_i \, \mathrm{ln}\Phi_{B+1}^*(\mathbf{l}_i,\mathbf{u}_i,\mathbf{\Sigma}_{i,b})$$

The conditional probabilities are

$$\Pr\left(y_i = v_h | \mathbf{x}_i, \mathbf{z}_{b1i}, \dots, \mathbf{z}_{bBi}, \mathbf{w}_{bi}\right) = \frac{\Phi_{B+1}^*(\mathbf{l}_{ih1}, \mathbf{u}_{ih1}, \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{i,b})}{\Phi_{B}^*(\mathbf{l}_{bi}, \mathbf{u}_{bi}, \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_b)}$$

#### **Treatment**

In the potential-outcomes framework, the treatment  $t_i$  is a discrete variable taking T values, indexing the T potential outcomes of the outcome  $y_i$ :  $y_{1i}$ , ...,  $y_{Ti}$ .

When we observe treatment  $t_i$  with levels  $v_1, \ldots, v_T$ , we have

$$y_i = \sum_{j=1}^{T} 1(t_i = v_{tj}) y_{ji}$$

So for each observation, we observe only the potential outcome associated with that observation's treatment value.

For exogenous treatments, our approach is equivalent to the regression adjustment treatment-effect estimation method. See [CAUSAL] **teffects intro advanced**. We do not model the treatment assignment process. The formulas for the treatment effects and potential-outcome means (POMs) are equivalent to what we provide here for endogenous treatments. The treatment effect on the treated for  $\mathbf{x}_i$  for an exogenous treatment is equivalent to what we provide here for the endogenous treatment when the correlation parameter between the outcome and treatment errors is set to 0. The average treatment effects (ATEs) and POMs for exogenous treatments are estimated as predictive margins in an analogous manner to what we describe here for endogenous treatments.

From here, we assume an endogenous treatment  $t_i$ . As in *Treatment* in [ERM] **eprobit**, we model the treatment assignment process with a probit or an ordered probit model, and we call the treatment assignment error  $\epsilon_{ti}$ . An ordered probit regression of  $y_i$  on treatment  $t_i$  with levels  $v_{t1}, \ldots, v_{tT}$  has the form

$$y_i = \sum_{j=1}^{T} 1(t_i = v_{tj}) y_{ji}$$

where for j = 1, ..., T and exogenous covariates  $\mathbf{x}_i$ 

$$y_{ji} = v_h$$
 iff  $\kappa_{(h-1)j} < \mathbf{x}_i \boldsymbol{\beta}_j + \epsilon_{ji} \le \kappa_{hj}$ 

The values  $v_1, \ldots, v_H$  are real numbers such that  $v_h < v_m$  for h < m. For  $j = 1, \ldots, T$ ,  $\kappa_{0j}$  is taken as  $-\infty$  and  $\kappa_{Hj}$  is taken as  $+\infty$ .

This model can be formulated with or without different correlation parameters for each potential outcome. Potential-outcome specific parameters are obtained by specifying pocorrelation in the entreat() option.

If the correlation parameters are not potential-outcome specific, for  $j=1,\ldots,T$ ,  $\epsilon_{ji}$  and  $\epsilon_{ti}$  are bivariate normal with mean 0 and covariance

$$\mathbf{\Sigma} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & \rho_{1t} \\ \rho_{1t} & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

The treatment is exogenous if  $\rho_{1t}=0$ . Note that we did not specify the structure of the correlations between the potential-outcome errors. We do not need information about these correlations to estimate POMs and treatment effects because all covariates and the outcome are observed in observations from each group.

From here, we discuss a model with an ordinal endogenous treatment. The results for binary treatment models are similar. Because the unobserved errors are bivariate normal, we can express the log likelihood in terms of the  $\Phi_2^*$  function.

For  $j = 1, \ldots, T$  and  $h = 0, \ldots, H$ , let

$$c_{1ihj} = \begin{cases} -\infty & h = 0 \\ \kappa_{hj} - \mathbf{x}_i \boldsymbol{\beta}_j & h = 1, \dots, H - 1 \\ \infty & h = H \end{cases}$$

The lower and upper limits for the  $y_i$  probability are

$$l_{1i} = c_{i(h-1)j}$$
 if  $y_i = v_h, t_i = v_{tj}$ 

and

$$u_{1i} = c_{ihj}$$
 if  $y_i = v_h, t_i = v_{tj}$ 

The log likelihood for the model is

$$\ln L = \sum_{i=1}^{N} w_i \ln \Phi_2^*([l_{1i} \quad l_{ti}], [u_{1i} \quad u_{ti}], \boldsymbol{\Sigma})$$

where the lower and upper limits for the treatment probability,  $l_{ti}$  and  $u_{ti}$ , are defined in *Treatment* in [ERM] **eprobit**.

The conditional probability of obtaining treatment level  $v_{th}$  is

$$\Pr(t_i = v_{th} | \mathbf{z}_{ti}) = \Phi_1^*(c_{ti(h-1)}, c_{tih}, 1)$$

where the cutpoints for the treatment probabilities  $c_{tij}$  are defined in *Treatment* in [ERM] eprobit.

For h = 1, ..., H, the conditional probabilities for outcome level  $v_h$  at treatment level  $v_{tj}$  are

$$\Pr(y_i = v_h | \mathbf{x}_i, \mathbf{z}_{ti}, t_i = v_{tj}) = \frac{\Phi_2^*([c_{1i(h-1)j} \ c_{ti(j-1)}], [c_{1ihj} \ c_{tij}], \mathbf{\Sigma})}{\Phi_1^*(c_{ti(j-1)}, c_{tij}, 1)}$$

The conditional POM for treatment group j and outcome category h is

$$POM_{hj}(\mathbf{x}_i) = E\left\{1(y_{ji} = v_h)|\mathbf{x}_i\right\} = \Phi_1^*(c_{1i(h-1)j}, c_{1i(h-1)j}, 1)$$

Conditional on the covariates  $\mathbf{x}_i$  and  $\mathbf{z}_{ti}$  and the treatment  $t_i = v_m$ , the POM for treatment group j and outcome category h is

$$\begin{aligned} \text{POM}_{hj}(\mathbf{x}_{i}, \mathbf{z}_{ti}, t_{i} = v_{m}) &= E\left\{1(y_{ji} = v_{h}) | \mathbf{x}_{i}, \mathbf{z}_{ti}, t_{i} = v_{tm}\right\} \\ &= \frac{\Phi_{2}^{*}(\left[c_{1i(h-1)j} - c_{ti(m-1)}\right], \left[c_{1ihj} - c_{tim}\right], \mathbf{\Sigma})}{\Phi_{1}^{*}(c_{ti(m-1)}, c_{tim}, 1)} \end{aligned}$$

Without loss of generality,  $t_i = v_{t1}$  corresponds to the control or base level of the treatment. Treatment effects are the differences between the potential outcomes  $y_{2i}, \ldots, y_{Ti}$  and the control  $y_{1i}$ . When the potential outcomes are ordered probit, the treatment effect on a particular category is of interest.

The treatment effect of treatment group j on category h is  $1(y_{ji} = v_h) - 1(y_{1i} = v_h)$ , the difference in the outcome for individual i on being in category h if the individual receives the treatment  $t_i = v_{tj}$  instead of the control  $t_i = v_{t1}$ . Evaluating this treatment effect lets us see how the treatment affects the probability of belonging to outcome category h.

For treatment group j, the treatment effect (TE) on category h conditioned on  $x_i$  is

$$TE_{hj}(\mathbf{x}_i) = E\left\{1(y_{ji} = v_h) - 1(y_{1i} = v_h)|\mathbf{x}_i\right\}$$
$$= POM_{hj}(\mathbf{x}_i) - POM_{h1}(\mathbf{x}_i)$$

For treatment group j, the treatment effect on the treated (TET) on category h in treatment group mconditioned on  $\mathbf{x}_i$  and  $\mathbf{z}_{ti}$  is

$$\begin{split} \text{Tet}_{hj}(\mathbf{x}_i, \mathbf{z}_{ti}, t_i = v_m) &= E\left\{1(y_{ji} = v_h) - 1(y_{1i} = v_h) | \mathbf{x}_i, t_i = v_{t,m}\right\} \\ &= \text{Pom}_{hj}(\mathbf{x}_i, \mathbf{z}_{ti}, t_i = v_m) - \text{Pom}_{h1}(\mathbf{x}_i, \mathbf{z}_{ti}, t_i = v_m) \end{split}$$

We can take the expectation of these conditional predictions over the covariates to get population average parameters. The estat teffects or margins command is used to estimate the expectations as predictive margins once the model is fit with eoprobit. The POM for treatment group j and outcome category h is

$$POM_{hj} = E\{1(y_{ji} = v_h)\} = E\{POM_{hj}(\mathbf{x}_i)\}$$

The ATE for treatment group j and outcome category h is

$$\text{ATE}_{hj} = E\left\{1(y_{ji} = v_h) - 1(y_{1i} = v_h)\right\} = E\left\{\text{TE}_{hj}(\mathbf{x}_i)\right\}$$

For treatment group j, the average treatment effect on the treated (ATET) for outcome category hin treatment group m is

$$ATET_{hjm} = E \left\{ 1(y_{ji} = v_h) - 1(y_{1i} = v_h) | t_i = v_m \right\}$$
$$= E \left\{ TET_{hj}(\mathbf{x}_i, \mathbf{z}_{ti}, t_i = v_m) | t_i = v_m \right\}$$

If the correlation parameters are potential-outcome specific, for  $j=1,\ldots,T,\,\epsilon_{ji}$  and  $\epsilon_{ti}$  are bivariate normal with mean 0 and covariance

$$\mathbf{\Sigma}_j = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & \rho_{j1t} \\ \rho_{j1t} & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

Now define

$$\mathbf{\Sigma}_i = \sum_{i=1}^T 1(t_i = v_j) \mathbf{\Sigma}_j$$

The log likelihood for the potential-outcome specification correlation model is

$$lnL = \sum_{i=1}^{N} w_i \ln \Phi_2^*([l_{1i} \quad l_{ti}], [u_{1i} \quad u_{ti}], \Sigma_i)$$

For h = 1, ..., H, the conditional probabilities for outcome level  $v_h$  at treatment level  $v_{tj}$  are now

$$\Pr(y_i = v_h | \mathbf{x}_i, \mathbf{z}_{ti}, t_i = v_{tj}) = \frac{\Phi_2^*([c_{1i(h-1)j} \ c_{ti(j-1)}], [c_{1ihj} \ c_{tij}], \mathbf{\Sigma}_j)}{\Phi_1^*(c_{ti(j-1)}, c_{tij}, 1)}$$

The conditional POM for exogenous covariates  $\mathbf{x}_i$ , treatment group j, and outcome category h has the same definition as in the single correlation case. However, when we also condition on the treatment level  $t_i = v_m$  and  $\mathbf{z}_{ti}$ , the POM for treatment group j and outcome category h is

$$\begin{aligned} \text{POM}_{hj}(\mathbf{x}_{i}, \mathbf{z}_{ti}, t_{i} = v_{m}) &= E\left\{1(y_{ji} = v_{h}) | \mathbf{x}_{i}, \mathbf{z}_{ti}, t_{i} = v_{tm}\right\} \\ &= \frac{\Phi_{2}^{*}(\left[c_{1i(h-1)j} \quad c_{ti(m-1)}\right], \left[c_{1ihj} \quad c_{tim}\right], \mathbf{\Sigma}_{j})}{\Phi_{1}^{*}(c_{ti(m-1)}, c_{tim}, 1)} \end{aligned}$$

Treatment effects are formulated as in the single correlation case but using these updated POM definitions. We can take the expectation of these conditional predictions over the covariates to get population-averaged parameters. The estat teffects or margins command is used to estimate the expectations as predictive margins once the model is fit with eoprobit.

## **Endogenous sample selection**

#### Probit endogenous sample selection

An ordered probit model for outcome  $y_i$  with selection on  $s_i$  has the form

$$y_i = v_h$$
 iff  $\kappa_{h-1} < \mathbf{x}_i \boldsymbol{\beta} + \epsilon_i \le \kappa_h$   
 $s_i = 1 (\mathbf{z}_{si} \boldsymbol{\alpha}_s + \epsilon_{si} > 0)$ 

where  $\mathbf{x}_i$  are covariates that affect the outcome and  $\mathbf{z}_{si}$  are covariates that affect selection. The outcome  $y_i$  is observed if  $s_i = 1$  and is not observed if  $s_i = 0$ . The values  $v_1, \ldots, v_H$  are real numbers such that  $v_h < v_m$  for h < m.  $\kappa_0$  is taken as  $-\infty$  and  $\kappa_H$  is taken as  $+\infty$ .

The unobserved errors  $\epsilon_i$  and  $\epsilon_{si}$  are normal with mean 0 and covariance

$$\mathbf{\Sigma} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & \rho_{1s} \\ \rho_{1s} & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

The lower and upper limits for the  $y_i$  probability,  $l_{1i}$  and  $u_{1i}$ , are as defined in (1)–(3). For the selection indicator, the lower and upper limits  $l_{si}$  and  $u_{si}$  are defined in *Probit endogenous sample selection* in [ERM] **eprobit**.

The log likelihood for the model is

$$\ln\! L = \sum_{i \in S} w_i \ln\! \Phi_2^*([\, l_{1i} \quad l_{si}\,], [\, u_{1i} \quad u_{si}\,], \mathbf{\Sigma}) + \sum_{i \notin S} w_i \ln\! \Phi_1^*(l_{si}, u_{si}, 1)$$

where S is the set of observations for which  $y_i$  is observed.

In this model, the probability of success is usually predicted conditional on the covariates  $x_i$  and not on the selection status  $s_i$ . The formulas for the conditional probability are thus the same as in (4).

The conditional probability of selection is

$$\Pr\left(s_i = 1 | \mathbf{z}_{si}\right) = \Phi_1^*(-\mathbf{z}_{si}\boldsymbol{\alpha}_s, \infty, 1)$$

#### Tobit endogenous sample selection

Instead of constraining the selection indicator to be binary, tobit endogenous sample selection uses a censored continuous sample-selection indicator. We allow the selection variable to be left- or right-censored.

An ordered probit model for outcome  $y_i$  with tobit selection on  $s_i$  has the form

$$y_i = v_h$$
 iff  $\kappa_{h-1} < \mathbf{x}_i \boldsymbol{\beta} + \epsilon_i < \kappa_h$ 

where the values  $v_1, \ldots, v_H$  are real numbers such that  $v_h < v_m$  for h < m.  $\kappa_0$  is taken as  $-\infty$ and  $\kappa_H$  is taken as  $+\infty$ .

We observe the selection indicator  $s_i$ , which indicates the censoring status of the latent selection variable  $s_i^{\star}$ ,

$$s_i^* = \mathbf{z}_{si}\alpha_s + \epsilon_{si}$$

$$s_i = \begin{cases} l_i & s_i^* \le l_i \\ s_i^* & l_i < s_i^* < u_i \\ u_i & s_i^* \ge u_i \end{cases}$$

where  $\mathbf{z}_{si}$  are covariates that affect selection and  $l_i$  and  $u_i$  are fixed lower and upper limits.

The outcome  $y_i$  is observed when  $s_i^{\star}$  is not censored. If  $l_i < s_i^{\star} < u_i$ , then  $y_i$  is observed.  $y_i$  is not observed if  $s_i^{\star} \leq l_i$ , that is, if  $s_i^{\star}$  is left-censored.  $y_i$  is also not observed if  $s_i^{\star}$  is right-censored,  $s_i^{\star} \geq u_i$ . The unobserved errors  $\epsilon_i$  and  $\epsilon_{si}$  are normal with mean 0 and covariance

$$\begin{bmatrix} 1 & \rho_{1s}\sigma_s \\ \rho_{1s}\sigma_s & \sigma_s^2 \end{bmatrix}$$

For the selected observations, we can treat  $s_i$  as a continuous endogenous regressor, as in Continuous endogenous covariates. In fact,  $s_i$  may even be used as a regressor for  $y_i$  in eoprobit (specify tobitselect(... main)). On the nonselected observations, we treat  $s_i$  like the probit endogenous sample-selection indicator in Probit endogenous sample selection.

The conditional mean of  $\epsilon_i$  is used in the lower and upper limits for the  $y_i$  probability for selected observations. Let

$$c_{i,h} = \begin{cases} -\infty & h = 0 \\ \kappa_h - \mathbf{x}_i \boldsymbol{\beta} - \rho_{1s} \sigma_s^{-1} \left( s_i - \mathbf{z}_{si} \alpha_c \right) & h = 1, \dots, H - 1 \\ \infty & h = H \end{cases}$$

The limits for the  $y_i$  probability for selected observations are

$$l_{1i} = c_{i(h-1)} \quad \text{if} \quad y_i = v_h$$

and

$$u_{1i} = c_{ih}$$
 if  $y_i = v_h$ 

It follows that the log likelihood is

$$\begin{split} \ln & L = \sum_{i \in S} w_i \left\{ \ln \Phi_1^*(\, l_{1i} \,,\, u_{1i} \,, 1 - \rho_{1s}^2) + \, \ln \phi(s_i - \mathbf{z}_{si} \alpha_s, \sigma_s^2) \right\} \\ & + \sum_{i \in L} w_i \ln \Phi_1^*(l_{li}, u_{li}, 1) \\ & + \sum_{i \in U} w_i \ln \Phi_1^*(l_{ui}, u_{ui}, 1) \end{split}$$

where S is the set of observations for which  $y_i$  is observed, L is the set of observations where  $s_i^{\star}$  is left-censored, and U is the set of observations where  $s_i^{\star}$  is right-censored. The lower and upper limits for selection— $l_{li}$ ,  $u_{li}$ ,  $l_{ui}$ , and  $u_{ui}$ —are defined in *Tobit endogenous sample selection* in [ERM] **eprobit**.

The conditional probabilities on  $s_i = S_i$  are

$$\Pr(y_i = v_h | \mathbf{x}_i) = \Phi_1^*(c_{i(h-1)}, c_{ih}, 1 - \rho_{1s}^2)$$

If we do not include  $s_i$  in the main outcome equation, the probability of success is calculated as (4) again.

#### Random effects

For an ordered probit regression with random effects, we observe panel data. For panel i = 1, ..., N and observation  $j = 1, ..., N_i$ , an ordered probit regression of  $y_{ij}$  on covariates  $\mathbf{x}_{ij}$  with random effect  $u_i$  may be written as

$$y_{ij} = v_h$$
 iff  $\kappa_{h-1} < \mathbf{x}_{ij}\boldsymbol{\beta} + \epsilon_{ij} + u_i \le \kappa_h$ 

The values  $v_1, \ldots, v_H$  are real numbers such that  $v_h < v_m$  for h < m.  $\kappa_0$  is taken as  $-\infty$  and  $\kappa_H$  is taken as  $+\infty$ . The random effect  $u_i$  is normal with mean 0 and variance  $\sigma_u^2$ . It is independent of the observation-level error  $\epsilon_{ij}$ , which is standard normal.

We derive the likelihood by using the conditional density of  $y_{ij}$  on the random effect  $u_i$  and the marginal density of  $u_i$ . Multiplying them together, we have the joint density, which is integrated over  $u_i$ .

Let

$$l_{ij}(u) = \begin{bmatrix} 1(y_{ij} = v_1)\Phi\left(-\mathbf{x}_{ij}\boldsymbol{\beta} - u\right) \\ + \sum_{h=2}^{H-1} 1(y_{ij} = v_h)\left\{\Phi\left(\kappa_h - \mathbf{x}_{ij}\boldsymbol{\beta} - u\right) - \Phi\left(\kappa_{h-1} - \mathbf{x}_{ij}\boldsymbol{\beta} - u\right)\right\} \\ + 1(y_{ij} = v_H)\Phi\left(\mathbf{x}_{ij}\boldsymbol{\beta} + u\right) \end{bmatrix}$$

The likelihood for panel i is

$$L_{i} = \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \phi\left(\frac{u_{i}}{\sigma_{u}}\right) \prod_{j=1}^{N_{i}} l_{ij}(u_{i}) du_{i}$$

We can approximate this integral using Gauss-Hermite quadrature. For q-point Gauss-Hermite quadrature, let the abscissa and weight pairs be denoted by  $(a_{ki}, w_{ki})$ ,  $k = 1, \ldots, q$ . The Gauss-Hermite quadrature approximation is then

$$\int_{-\infty}^{\infty} f(x) \exp(-x^2) dx \approx \sum_{k=1}^{q} w_{ki} f(a_{ki})$$

The default approximation used by xteoprobit is mean-variance adaptive Gauss-Hermite quadrature. This chooses optimal abscissa and weights for each panel. See *Likelihood for multiequation models* in [ERM] **eprobit** for more information on the use of mean-variance adaptive Gauss-Hermite quadrature.

Using the quadrature approximation, the log likelihood is

$$\ln L = \sum_{i=1}^{N} \ln \left\{ \sum_{k=1}^{q} w_{ki} \prod_{j=1}^{N_i} l_{ij}(\sigma_u a_{ki}) \right\}$$

Now we will derive the conditional probabilities of success. These are similar to those given in *Introduction*, but the variance input to  $\Phi_1^{\star}$  is the variance of the random effect plus the observation-level error.

First, let

$$\xi_{ij} = \epsilon_{ij} + u_i$$

 $\xi_{ij}$  is normal with mean 0 and variance  $\sigma_{\xi}^2 = 1 + \sigma_u^2$ .

Now, for  $h = 0, \ldots, H$ , define

$$c_{ijh} = \begin{cases} -\infty & h = 0 \\ (\kappa_h - \mathbf{x}_{ij}\boldsymbol{\beta}) & h = 1, \dots, H - 1 \\ \infty & h = H \end{cases}$$

For h = 1, ..., H, the conditional probabilities of success are

$$\Pr(y_{ij} = v_h | \mathbf{x}_{ij}) = \Phi_1^*(c_{ij(h-1)}, c_{ijh}, \sigma_{\varepsilon}^2)$$

#### Combinations of features

Extended ordered probit regression models that involve multiple features can be formulated using the techniques discussed in *Likelihood for multiequation models* in [ERM] **eprobit**. Essentially, the density of the observed endogenous covariates can be written in terms of the unobserved normal errors. The observed endogenous and exogenous covariates determine the range of the errors, and the joint density can be evaluated as multivariate normal probabilities and densities.

#### Confidence intervals

The estimated variances will always be nonnegative, and the estimated correlations will always fall in (-1,1). We use transformations to obtain confidence intervals that accommodate these ranges.

We use the log transformation to obtain the confidence intervals for variance parameters and the atanh transformation to obtain confidence intervals for correlation parameters. For details, see Confidence intervals in [ERM] eprobit.

#### References

Amemiya, T. 1985. Advanced Econometrics. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Bartus, T., and D. Roodman. 2014. Estimation of multiprocess survival models with cmp. Stata Journal 14: 756-777.

Botezat, A., and F. Pfeiffer. 2014. The impact of parents' migration on the well-being of children left behind: Initial evidence from Romania. IZA Discussion Paper No. 8225, Institute for the Study of Labor (IZA). http://ftp.iza.org/dp8225.pdf.

Chyi, H., and S. Mao. 2012. The determinants of happiness of China's elderly population. Journal of Happiness Studies 13: 167–185. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10902-011-9256-8.

De Luca, G., and V. Perotti. 2011. Estimation of ordered response models with sample selection. Stata Journal 11: 213-239.

Gregory, C. A. 2015. Estimating treatment effects for ordered outcomes using maximum simulated likelihood. Stata Journal 15: 756-774.

Heckman, J. J. 1976. The common structure of statistical models of truncation, sample selection and limited dependent variables and a simple estimator for such models. Annals of Economic and Social Measurement 5: 475-492.

-. 1979. Sample selection bias as a specification error. Econometrica 47: 153–161. https://doi.org/10.2307/1912352.

Maddala, G. S. 1983. Limited-Dependent and Qualitative Variables in Econometrics. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Maddala, G. S., and L.-F. Lee. 1976. Recursive models with qualitative endogenous variables. Annals of Economic and Social Measurement 5: 525-545.

Roodman, D. 2011. Fitting fully observed recursive mixed-process models with cmp. Stata Journal 11: 159-206.

White, H. L., Jr. 1996. Estimation, Inference and Specification Analysis. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Wooldridge, J. M. 2010. Econometric Analysis of Cross Section and Panel Data. 2nd ed. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

—. 2014. Quasi-maximum likelihood estimation and testing for nonlinear models with endogenous explanatory variables. Journal of Econometrics 182: 226–234. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jeconom.2014.04.020.

# Also see

[ERM] **eoprobit postestimation** — Postestimation tools for eoprobit and xteoprobit

[ERM] eoprobit predict — predict after eoprobit and xteoprobit

[ERM] **predict advanced** — predict's advanced features

[ERM] **predict treatment** — predict for treatment statistics

[ERM] estat teffects — Average treatment effects for extended regression models

[ERM] Intro 9 — Conceptual introduction via worked example

[R] **heckoprobit** — Ordered probit model with sample selection

[R] **oprobit** — Ordered probit regression

[SVY] svy estimation — Estimation commands for survey data

[XT] **xtoprobit** — Random-effects ordered probit models

## [U] 20 Estimation and postestimation commands

Stata, Stata Press, and Mata are registered trademarks of StataCorp LLC. Stata and Stata Press are registered trademarks with the World Intellectual Property Organization of the United Nations. StataNow and NetCourseNow are trademarks of StataCorp LLC. Other brand and product names are registered trademarks or trademarks of their respective companies. Copyright © 1985–2023 StataCorp LLC, College Station, TX, USA. All rights reserved.



For suggested citations, see the FAQ on citing Stata documentation.